

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS..... i

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES iv

ARGUMENT IN REPLY..... 1

I. INTRODUCTION 1

**II. PLAINTIFFS’ CLAIMS ARE ACTIONABLE UNDER
THE ATS AS CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL
LAW AND FEDERAL COMMON LAW..... 4**

1. Pre-Sosa Case Law Cited With Approval In Sosa 4

2. *Sosa v. Alvarez-Mechain* 9

3. Defendants’ Misconception Of The *Sosa* Standard..... 13

**4. The Application Of the Proper Sosa Standard Demonstrates
That The Bans On Poison And Excessive Destruction
Without Military Necessity Are At Least As Specific and
Universally Accepted As The Three Blackstonian Norms 16**

**a. Defendants Confuse The Norms
With Their Application 16**

**b. The United States Government’s View At The
Time That The Use Of A Poisonous Herbicide
That Was Harmful To Human Beings Flatly
Contradicts The Defendants’ Argument 18**

c.	State Practice Confirms That States Treat These Norms As Binding.....	20
d.	Scholarly Commentary Establishes The Existence And Specificity of These Norms	24
e.	Defendants Cannot Avoid Liability On The Theory That The Intent Of The United States Military Was Merely To Defoliate And Not To Poison Crops Or The Water Supply In Vietnam	28
III.	NON-STATE ACTORS CAN BE SUED UNDER THE ATS FOR VIOLATIONS OF CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW.....	32
1.	There Is Aiding And Abetting Liability Under The ATS	32
2.	Defendants’ Status As Corporations Does Not Immunize Them From Liability	38
IV.	FEDERAL COMMON LAW AND STATUTORY DEFENSES ARE INAPPLICABLE TO PLAINTIFFS’ INTERNATIONAL LAW CLAIMS	40
1.	The Government Contractor Defense Is Inapplicable	40
2.	Statutory Defenses	43
V.	THIS CASE IS JUSTICIABLE AND NOT PRECLUDED BY THE POLITICAL QUESTION DOCTRINE.....	44
1.	The Political Question Doctrine Is Rarely Applied And Almost Never In The Context Of Foreign Affairs.....	44
2.	Defendants Fail To Satisfy Any Of The <u>Baker</u> Elements	47

3. Plaintiffs’ Claims Are Manifestly Not Barred By The Political Question Doctrine In Light Of The Supreme Court’s Recent Decisions In <u>Rasul</u> And Hamdi.....	51
4. Defendants’ Argument Is Predicated On Inapplicable Cases	52
CONCLUSION	55
CERTIFICATION PURSUANT TO F.R.A.P. 32(a)(7)(B) & (C)	57

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

FEDERAL CASES

<i>In re Agent Orange Prod. Liability Litigation</i> , 373 F.Supp.2d 7 (E.D.N.Y. 2005)	40, 42, 43, 54
<i>Aguinda v. Texaco, Inc.</i> , 303 F.3d 470 (2d Cir. 2002)	39
<i>America Insurance Association v. Garamendi</i> , 539 U.S. 396 (2003)	53
<i>Argentine Republic v. Amerada Hess Shipping Corp.</i> , 488 U.S. 428 (1989)	39
<i>Baker v. Carr</i> , 369 U.S. 186 (1962)	4, 45, 46, 48, 49
<i>Bigio v. Coca-Cola Co.</i> , 239 F.3d 440 (2d Cir. 2000)	39
<i>Biton v. Palestinian Interim Self-Government Authority</i> , 310 F. Supp. 2d 172 (D.D.C. 2004)	49
<i>Bodner v. Banque Paribas</i> , 114 F. Supp. 2d 117 (E.D.N.Y. 2000)	33
<i>Boim v. Quranic Literacy Institute</i> , 291 F.3d 1000 (7th Cir. 2002)	37, 38
<i>Bowoto v. Chevron Texaco Corp.</i> , 312 F. Supp. 2d 1229 (N.D. Cal. 2004)	39

<i>Boyle v. United Techs. Corp.</i> , 487 U.S. 500 (1988)	41
<i>Breach of Neutrality</i> , 1 Op. Att'y Gen. 57 (1795)	9, 34
<i>Burger-Fischer v. Degussa AG</i> , 65 F. Supp. 2d 248 (D.N.J. 1999)	53, 54
<i>Burnett v. Al Bar Investment & Development Corp.</i> , 292 F. Supp. 2d 9 (D.D.C. 2003)	33
<i>Bush v. Gore</i> , 531 U.S. 98 (2000)	46
<i>Bush v. Palm Beach County Canvassing Board</i> , 531 U.S. 70 (2000)	46
<i>Carmichael v. United Techs. Corp.</i> , 835 F.2d 109 (5th Cir. 1988)	39
<i>Central Bank of Denver v. First Interstate Bank</i> , 511 U.S. 164 (1994)	37
<i>Corrie v. Caterpillar, Inc.</i> , 403 F. Supp. 2d 1019 (W.D. Wash. 2005)	38
<i>County of Oneida v. Oneida Indian Nation</i> , 470 U.S. 226 (1985)	47
<i>Davis v. Bandemer</i> , 478 U.S. 109 (1986)	47
<i>Doe v. Karadzic</i> , 866 F. Supp. 734 (S.D.N.Y. 1994)	8

<i>Eastman Kodak Co. v. Kavlin</i> , 978 F. Supp. 1078 (S.D.Fla. 1997)	34
<i>Elrod v. Burns</i> , 427 U.S. 347 (1976)	47
<i>Filartiga v. Pena-Irala</i> , 630 F.2d 876 (2d Cir. 1980)	1, 4, 6
<i>First National City Bank v. Banco Para El Comercio</i> , 462 U.S. 611 (1983)	39
<i>Fisher v. Halliburton</i> , 390 F. Supp. 2d 610 (S.D. Tex. 2005)	44
<i>Gilligan v. Morgan</i> , 413 U.S. 1 (1973)	46
<i>Goldwater v. Carter</i> , 444 U.S. 996 (1979)	46
<i>Halberstam v. Welch</i> , 705 F.2d 472 (D.C. Cir. 1983)	36
<i>Hamdi v. Rumsfeld</i> , 542 U.S. 507 (2004)	46, 52
<i>Hilao v. Estate of Marcos</i> , 103 F.3d 767 (9th Cir. 1996)	34
<i>Ibrahim v. Titan Corp.</i> , 391 F. Supp. 2d 10 (D.D.C. 2005)	45
<i>Immigration & Naturalization Serv. v. Chadha</i> , 462 U.S. 919 (1983)	47

<i>Iwanowa v. Ford Motor Co.</i> , 67 F. Supp. 2d 424 (D.N.J. 1999)	33
<i>Japan Whaling Association v. America Cetacean Society</i> , 478 U.S. 221 (1986)	47
<i>Jota v. Texaco, Inc.</i> , 157 F.3d 153 (2d Cir. 1998)	39
<i>Kadic v. Karadzic</i> , 70 F.3d 232 (2d Cir. 1995)	8, 8, 33, 50, 51
<i>Klinghoffer v. S.N.C. Achille Lauro</i> , 937 F.2d 44 (2d Cir. 1991)	49
<i>Koohi v. United States</i> , 976 F.2d 1328 (9th Cir. 1992)	44
<i>Lamont v. Woods</i> , 948 F.2d 825 (2d Cir. 1991)	47
<i>Little v. Barreme</i> , 6 U.S. (2 Cranch) 170 (1804)	42, 43
<i>Nixon v. United States</i> , 506 U.S. 224 (1993)	46
<i>Olegario v. United States</i> , 629 F.2d 204 (2d Cir. 1980)	48
<i>Powell v. McCormack</i> , 395 U.S. 486 (1969)	47
<i>Presbyterian Church of Sudan v. Talisman Energy, Inc.</i> , 244 F. Supp. 2d 289 (S.D.N.Y. 2003)	33, 35, 37, 39

<i>Quinn v. Millsap</i> , 491 U.S. 95 (1989)	47
<i>Rasul v. Bush</i> , 542 U.S. 466 (2004)	46, 51, 52
<i>Schneider v. Kissinger</i> , 412 F.3d 190 (D.C. Cir. 2005)	55
<i>Sharon v. Time</i> , 599 F. Supp. 538 (S.D.N.Y. 1984)	49
<i>Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain</i> , 542 U.S. 692 (2004)	seratim
<i>In re South African Apartheid Litigation</i> , 346 F. Supp. 2d 538 (S.D.N.Y. 2004)	38
<i>Sterling v. Constantin</i> , 287 U.S. 378 (1932)	52
<i>Talbot v. Jansen</i> , 3 U.S. (3 Dall.) 133 (1795)	15, 34
<i>Tel-Oren v. Libyan Arab Republic</i> , 726 F.2d 774 (D.C. Cir. 1984)	6, 16,18, 36
<i>The Amiable Nancy</i> , 1 F. Cas. 765 (C.C. N.Y. 1817), <i>aff'd</i> , 16 U.S. 546 (1818)	43
<i>The Paquete Habana</i> , 175 U.S. 677 (1900)	6
<i>Trans World Airlines, Inc. v. Franklin Mint Corp.</i> , 466 U.S. 243 (1984)	47

<i>Uhler v. AFL-CIO</i> , 468 U.S. 1310 (1984)	47
<i>United States Department of Commerce v. Montana</i> , 503 U.S. 442 (1992)	47
<i>United States v. Furlong</i> , 18 U.S. (5 Wheat.) 184, 5 L.Ed. 64 (1820)	8
<i>United States v. Munoz-Flores</i> , 495 U.S. 385 (1990)	45, 47
<i>United States v. Nixon</i> , 418 U.S. 683 (1974)	47
<i>United States v. Ruffin</i> , 613 F.2d 408 (2d Cir. 1979)	29
<i>United States v. Smith</i> , 18 U.S. (5 Wheat.) 153 (1820)	3, 14, 18
<i>Vieth v. Jubelirer</i> , 541 U.S. 267 (2004)	45, 47
<i>W.S. Kirkpatrick & Co. v. Environmental Tectonics Corp.</i> , 493 U.S. 400 (1990)	49
<i>Wesberry v. Sanders</i> , 376 U.S. 1 (1964)	47
<i>Wiwa v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co.</i> , 226 F.3d 88 (2d Cir. 2000)	39
<i>Wiwa v. Royal Dutch Petroleum Co.</i> , No. 96 Civ. 8386, 2002 WL 319887 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 28, 2002)	33

FEDERAL STATUTES AND AUTHORITIES

18 U.S.C. § 2333(a)	37
Alien Tort Claims Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1350	seriatim
Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(7)(C)	58
Federal Tort Claims Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2680(j)	40-41, 44
H.R. Rep. No. 102-367, <i>reprinted in</i> 1992 U.S.C.C.A.N. 84	12
Public Vessels Act, 46 U.S.C. App. § 781 <u>et seq</u>	44
S. Rep. No. 102-249 (1991), <i>reprinted at</i> 1991 WL 258662 (Nov. 26, 1991)	12
Torture Victim Protection Act, 28 U.S.C. §1350.	11, 36
U.S. Const. art. III § 2	48

INTERNATIONAL CASES

<i>Prosecutor v. Furundzija</i> , Case No. IT-95-17/1/T (ICTY Trial Chamber, Dec. 10, 1998), <i>reprinted at</i> 38 I.L.M. 317 (1999)	35
<i>In re Tesch</i> , 1 Tr. War Crim. 93, 101-02 (1947)	32, 43
<i>In re Tesch</i> , 13 Int'l L. Rep. 250 (Br. Mil. Ct. 1946)	34, 42
<i>The Kupreskic Judgment</i> Case No. IT-95-16-T 14 (Jan. 2000)	28

<i>United States v. Flick</i> , 6 Trials Of War Criminals (1985) 1187	42, 43
<i>United States v. Krupp</i> , 9 Trials Of War Criminals 1327 (1950)	32, 42

MISCELLANEOUS AUTHORITIES

1907 Hague Regulations, 36 Stat. 2277 (Oct. 18, 1907, annex)	seriatim
Department of the Army, Pamphlet 27-161-2, International Law Volume II, 44 (1962), <i>citing United States Manual, Law of Naval Warfare</i> (1955)	22
Erwin Chemerinsky, <i>Federal Jurisdiction</i> (3d ed. 1999)	50
Richard Falk, <i>The Vietnam War and International Law</i> , Volume 2 (Princeton University Press, 1969) 516	24
Richard Falk, <i>The Vietnam War and International Law</i> , Volume 4 (Princeton University Press, 1969) 287	24
L. Friedman The Law of War, A Documentary History-Volume I (Random House 1972)	23, 40
Geneva Convention of 1949	21
Geneva Protocol of 1925	21, 23
International Council on Human Rights Policy, <i>Beyond Voluntarism: Human Rights and The Developing International Legal Obligations of Companies</i> (2002) available at http://www.ichrp.org/ac/excerpts/41.pdf 2002)	39

J.N. Moore, "Ratification of the Geneva Protocol on Gas and Bacteriological Warfare: A Legal and Political Analysis," 58 Va. L. Rev. 419 (1972)	24, 25, 26
Jordan Paust, "After My Lai: The Case for War Crimes Jurisdiction Over Civilians in Federal District Courts," <i>in</i> 4 <i>The Vietnam War and International Law</i> 447	9
Louis Henkin, <i>Foreign Affairs and the Constitution</i> 224 (1972)	7
<i>Restatement (Second) of Torts</i> § 876(b) (1977)	36
<i>Restatement (Third) of The Foreign Relations Law of the United States</i> § 421(2)	40
Stockholm International Peace Research Institute, "The Problem of Chemical and Biological Warfare, A Study of the Historical, Technical, Military, Legal, and Political Aspects of CBW, and Possible Disarmament Measures," <i>in</i> <i>CBW and the Law of War</i> (1973)	16, 22, 23, 25
Beth Stephens, "Corporate Liability: Enforcing Human Rights through Domestic Litigation," 24 <i>Hastings Int'l & Comp. L. Rev.</i> 401 (2001)	36
Beth Stephens, " <i>Sosa v. Alvarez-Machain</i> : 'The Door Is Still Ajar' For Human Rights Litigation In U.S. Courts," 70 <i>Brook. L. Rev.</i> 533, 554 (2004)	13
Beth Stephens and Michael Ratner, <i>International Human Rights Litigation in U.S. Courts</i> (Transnational Publishers 1996)	36

Steven R. Ratner, "Corporations and Human Rights: A Theory of Legal Responsibility," 111 Yale L.J. 443 (2001)	39
Telford Taylor, "Nuremberg Trials: War Crimes and International Law," 450 Int'l Conciliation 304 (April 1949)	9
United Nations General Assembly Resolution 2677 (XXV) (December 9, 1970)	21
International Court of Justice <i>Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Op. No. 95,</i> 1996 I.C.J. 226 (July 8, 1996)	27
United States Department of the Army, Field Manual (1956)	seriatim
Wil D. Verwey, <i>Riot Control Agents and Herbicides in War</i> (A.W. Sijthoff 1977)	24

